

**BACK TO THE FUTURE,
FOR BETTER OR WORSE?
MEANINGS OF MARRIAGE FOR YOUNG
WOMEN IN THE LOWER HUNTER REGION,
AUSTRALIA**

E. Kirby

Back to the future, for better or worse?
Meanings of marriage for young women in the
Lower Hunter region, Australia

by
Emma Kirby
Bachelor of Science (Hons.)

A thesis submitted
in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
The University of Newcastle
September 2009

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

Signed.....

Date.....

Some of the findings contained in Chapter Eight of this thesis can be found in a paper entitled 'Coexisting Detraditionalization and Retraditionalization Trends in Young White Middle Class Women's Marriage Attitudes', in the Refereed Conference Proceedings for The Australian Sociological Association Conference, The University of Melbourne: December 2-5, 2008. ISBN: 978-0-7340-3984-2.

Abstract

Why do young women still choose to marry in the new millennium? Although conjugal diversity in Australia has increased and crude marriage rates have decreased, the majority of young women still desire marriage. Marriage clearly remains important. The institution of marriage, despite high divorce rates, continues to exist as the most powerful and widely acknowledged form of social contract. Few empirical studies have focused on the meanings young women ascribe to marriage. Rather, marriage tends to be regarded as a stable concept around which to research and investigate. The meanings and definitions of marriage, particularly how young people identify marriage within their wider identity, has been ignored in much of the literature. This acceptance of marriage and its meaning within existing literature universalises and reinforces marriage as a dominant social and societal norm, whereby prestige is attached across cultures and through time. Marriage has sustained its centrality within social science research, yet without justification or adequate problematising. Meanwhile, in gender studies there is a tendency to assume that marriage is an outdated concept which has been superseded by the sexual revolution and by second wave feminism. As a result, feminist studies have not addressed the apparent persistence of marriage as a goal for young women. This thesis project contributes to filling that identified gap by addressing the apparent persistence of marriage as a goal for young women in Australia.

This mixed methods study maintains a focus on qualitative methodologies and feminist epistemologies, aiming to provide rich subjective accounts of marriage. The study

comprises data from 225 surveys. It also includes data from in-depth semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions with 75 of the survey participants. All three kinds of data collection asked about the meanings of marriage for young women. The participants were women aged 18 to 35 years, of various relationship statuses, from the Newcastle and Lower Hunter region of New South Wales, Australia. Participants were purposefully sampled to allow a spread of age and relationship status. Although this was not specifically intended, as a cohort they can be described as predominantly white and middle class. A grounded theory approach in line with Glaser and Strauss (1967) was employed to uncover subjective narratives that revealed attitudes and feelings towards the place of marriage and intimate relationships in the young women's life trajectories.

The findings of this study result from descriptive statistical analysis of survey data, and from content and discourse analysis of interviews and focus groups that indicate participants' discursive constructions of marriage. The study finds that participants position marriage as a marker of status, as important for child bearing, as well as the major factor in achieving a competent and legitimate mature feminine identity. This study presents an overview of young Australian women's aspirations for, and experiences of marriage and intimate relationships. It offers fresh insights into the ways these women imagine marriage and the marital relationship within their life trajectory. An integrated account of feminist critiques of marriage, and theorising on individualization and detraditionalization, allows us to see how gender inequalities are maintained in marital relationships under the discourse of individualization. This study offers evidence that emphasises the need for continuing feminist critiques of marriage

and the family.

The findings of this study suggest that the neo-liberal discourse of individualization has encouraged the idea of gender neutrality, equality and autonomy within the marital relationship. At the same time the young women indicate that they expect to put the interests and wishes of a future husband ahead of their own. High levels of personal compromise are foreshadowed. Yet their imagined futures include more than marriage. They do wish for self-fulfilment and many want careers. However, marriage is constructed as the anchoring status and identity that makes those goals legitimate and achievable. The study finds evidence of both detraditionalization and retraditionalization trends in the aspirations, expectations and lived realities of the young women interviewed. It is argued that attitudes towards marriage reflect the detraditionalization process to some extent, yet concurrently indicate the retraditionalization process; for example in the desire for full church weddings and in the defence of women taking responsibility for housework and raising children.

Contents

	Page
Acknowledgements	xiii
Chapter One: Introduction	1
My interest in marriage in Australia	3
Why study young women?	5
Research aims and questions	7
Organisation of the thesis	9
Chapter Two: Theorising Marriage and Intimate Relationships	
Introduction	13
The Feminist critique of marriage	13
The foundations of contemporary feminist critiques of marriage	15
Second-wave feminist positions on marriage	17
Marriage as a sexual contract	18
Marriage and women's choices	19
Contemporary marriage – a feminist stalemate?	21
The 'wife' and the nuclear family	22
Marriage and the division of labour	23
Outcomes and effects of the feminist critique of marriage	24
The implicit shortcomings of feminist critiques of marriage	25
Contemporary theories on marriage and the family – a paradigm shift?	28
The significance of Beck, Beck and Beck Gernsheim and Giddens	31
Ulrich Beck and Elisabeth Beck-Gernsheim	31
- <i>Risk Society and The Normal Chaos of Love</i>	31
Anthony Giddens	33
- <i>The Transformation of Intimacy</i>	34
- Giddens' 'romantic' and 'confluent love' and the 'pure relationship'	35
Individualization	37
The shortcomings of individualization	41
Detraditionalization	42
The shortcomings of detraditionalization	49
The paradox of marriage in reflexive modernity	50
Conclusion	51
Chapter Three: Literature Review	
Introduction	55
Marriage in Australia	56
The Family Values movement and the advantages of marriage for women	59
Meanings of the institution of marriage	63

The shortcomings of Family Values research	64
The feminist movement and the disadvantages of marriage for women	65
Why do women continue to choose marriage?	69
Marriage as entry into adulthood	70
Marriage and cohabitation	71
Marriage and children	75
Marriage as risk avoidance	76
Empirical work on marriage and individualization and detraditionalization	76
Conclusion	79

Chapter Four: Methodologies

Introduction	82
Research design	83
Grounded theory	88
Qualitative feminist research and informal interviewing	90
Incorporating feminist methodologies	92
Sampling	96
Data collection	96
Phase one: Survey	98
- Recruiting the participants – first attempt	98
- Recruiting the participants – second attempt	99
Phase two: Interviews and focus group discussions	103
- Interviews	105
- Focus groups	105
Phase three: follow-up interviews	108
Limitations of the research design	108
Data analysis	109
Open, axial and selective coding	110
Validity, reliability and reflexive research	111
The position of the researcher	113
Conclusion	119

Chapter Five: Setting the Scene

Introduction	121
Newcastle and the Lower Hunter region of New South Wales	122
Characteristics of the survey sample	124
Intention to marry	127
Attitudes towards Marriage	128
‘Being married means more to me than living together’	130
‘Being married means more to me than having a successful career’	131
‘I think I will be/am more successful as a married woman’	132
‘I would only have children if I was getting married’	133
‘My childhood experience of relationships has shaped my views on marriage’	134
‘Marriage is important for women in Australia today’	135

‘Marriage is less important today than it was 25 years ago’	137
Analysis of Demographic Variables	138
The relevance of age	138
The relevance of current relationship status	140
The relevance of income and educational achievement	140
The relevance of childhood experience	140
Typologies of women’s meanings of marriage – qualitative and quantitative	141
‘Romantics’	141
‘Traditionalists’	142
‘Hopefuls’	142
‘Non-conformists’	144
Participants brought up by two unmarried (biological) parents	148
Conclusion	151

Chapter Six: Participants’ Meanings of Marriage through the Life

Trajectory

Introduction	153
Youth	154
Childhood experience	154
Love, commitment, stability and security	157
Marriage as ‘more’	160
Marital dissolution	161
Marriage and children	166
Premarital ‘tests’	171
Adulthood and settling down’	174
Middle age to old age	179
Middle age	179
Old age – growing old alone?	186
Conclusion	188

Chapter Seven: Legitimacy, Authenticity and Competence: Marriage as a Socially Acknowledged Relationship

Introduction	190
‘First comes love, then comes marriage...’: Appropriate life trajectories	192
The timing of transitions – missing the ‘window’?	194
The appropriate relationship trajectory and avoiding stigma	197
Married status and the construction of a legitimate and competent feminine identity	199
‘Doing’ being married in the workplace	200
- Negotiating relationship status at work	204
Married status and social life	207
‘Doing’ good mothering	212
- Responsibilities for child care	214
- Unmarried (single) parenting	218
Being more than ‘just’ a wife	220

Being a wife and identity construction	221
Doing and having it all?	225
Identity as a married woman and personal autonomy	227
- Janine's experiences in marriage	228
Conclusion	232

Chapter Eight: Marriage, Individualization, Detraditionalization and Retraditionalization

Introduction	235
Detraditionalization	236
Deinstitutionalization and liberalised attitudes	237
Marriage as an individualized decision	238
Religion	238
Domestic transitions	239
'Starter' marriages	241
Premarital sex and cohabitation	243
Divorce	244
Increased pluralism/heterogenization	247
Consensus of ideals and attitudes	248
Retraditionalization	250
Continued traditional and institutional influences	251
Anxiety	253
Romantic love and legitimate feminine identity	254
Giddens' typologies of love	255
Confluent love and mutual disclosure	258
Contingency and compromise	262
Domestic living and pseudo-mutuality	265
Cultural authority	270
The discourse of individualization	273
The absence of gender consciousness in narratives	275
Conclusion	275

Chapter Nine: Conclusions and Implications of the Research

Introduction	278
Summary of the findings	279
Meanings of marriage through the life trajectory	279
Marriage and legitimate feminine identity: Having it all?	281
The pure relationship?	283
The discourse of individualization	284
Retraditionalization	286
Theoretical development and implications: Individualization versus gender	288
Sociological implications	290
Limitations of the study	293
Further future research	295
Concluding remarks	296

References	298
Appendices	328
Appendix One: Survey	329
Appendix Two: The Interview and Focus Group Participants, an Introduction	344
Appendix Three: University of Newcastle Human Research Ethics Committee Approval Notice	354

List of Tables

	Page
Chapter 3: Literature Review	
Table 3.1 Crude Marriage Rate for New South Wales: 1997-2006 (Source: Australian Bureau of Statistics)	57
Chapter 5: Survey Participants	
Table 5.1.1 Survey sample: Relationship status by age group	123
Table 5.1.2 Survey sample: Education level by age group	125
Table 5.2 Intention to marry by age group	127
Chapter 5: Survey Participants – Attitudes towards Marriage, by Age Group	
Table 5.3.1 ‘Being married means more to me than living together’	129
Table 5.3.2 ‘Being married means more to me than having a successful career’	130
Table 5.3.3 ‘I think I will be/am more successful as a married woman’	131
Table 5.3.4 ‘I would only have children if I was married/getting married’	133
Table 5.3.5 ‘My childhood experience of relationships has shaped by views on marriage’	134
Table 5.3.6 ‘Marriage is important for women in Australia today’	135
Table 5.3.7 ‘Marriage is less important today than it was 25 years ago’	136
Table 5.4 When would you ideally like to marry?	138
Table 5.5 Appendix Two: Interview and Focus Group Participants	342

Acknowledgements

Firstly, I would like to thank my supervisors. Associate Professor Pam Nilan has been an inspirational mentor. She has been profoundly generous and dedicated, and has taught me many valuable lessons. I am also deeply grateful to Dr Ann Taylor for her encouragement and enthusiasm. I have benefited on many occasions from their wisdom and attention to detail. Thanks must also go to the following staff members from the discipline of Sociology at the University of Newcastle: Lena Rodriguez, Associate Professor John Germov, Dr Helen Belcher and Dr Terry Leahy amongst others, have always been approachable and encouraged me in various ways – I am grateful for their support. Special thanks must go to my colleague Steven Threadgold, with whom I have shared both an office and the PhD experience.

I am forever indebted to my family: Paul, Hilary and James, who have provided me great encouragement, love and material assistance over the years. Thanks to my grandmother Una, for being a source of inspiration, and is always able to make me smile. My Australian ‘family’ have made me feel at home here – in particular Sascha, Brad, Jen, Stephen, Mark, Nina and Shevaun – you are all a constant distraction; I wouldn’t have it any other way.

Finally, I am most grateful to all of the young women who participated in the project. It was a privilege to listen to their aspirations and dreams for the future. I am exceptionally appreciative of the extent to which they shared with me their private and personal accounts of their intimate relationship

